



# City of Santa Barbara

## HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION

### MINUTES

### OCTOBER 16, 2019

1:30 P.M.  
David Gebhard Public Meeting Room  
630 Garden Street  
[SantaBarbaraCA.gov](http://SantaBarbaraCA.gov)

#### COMMISSION MEMBERS:

Anthony Grumbine, *Chair*  
Steve Hausz, *Vice Chair*  
Michael Drury  
Wendy Edmunds  
Ed Lenvik  
Bill Mahan  
Wayne Nemec  
Robert Ooley  
Julio J. Veyna

**ADVISORY MEMBER:** Dr. Michael Glassow

**CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:** Jason Dominguez

**PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:** Sheila Lodge

#### STAFF:

Tava Ostrenger, Assistant City Attorney  
Irma Unzueta, Design Review Supervisor  
Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian  
Pilar Plummer, Planning Technician  
Heidi Reidel, Commission Secretary

---

#### CALL TO ORDER

The Full Commission meeting was called to order at 1:32 p.m. by Chair Grumbine.

#### ATTENDANCE

Commissioners present: Grumbine, Hausz, Drury (absent 2:14-2:19 p.m., until 5:35 p.m.), Lenvik, Mahan, Nemec, Ooley (until 5:35 p.m.), and Veyna (until 5:00 p.m.)

Commissioners absent: Edmunds

Staff present: Ostrenger (until 4:59 p.m.), Hernandez (until 5:50 p.m.), Plummer, and Reidel

#### GENERAL BUSINESS

##### A. Public Comment:

The following individuals spoke:

1. Rick Closson. Cathy Closson ceded time to Mr. Closson.
2. Mary Louise Days

Written correspondence from Rick Closson was received.

##### B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approve the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of **October 2, 2019**, as amended.

Action: Ooley/Mahan, 7/0/1. (Hausz abstained on Item 2, 135 E Ortega St. Edmunds absent.) Motion carried.

## C. Approval of the Consent Calendar:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **October 16, 2019**, as reviewed by Commissioner Mahan.

Action: Ooley/Drury, 8/0/0. (Edmunds absent.) Motion carried.

## D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals:

## 1. Ms. Plummer announced the following:

- a. Electronic copies of project plans are now available online at the City of Santa Barbara website on the applicable design review board page where agendas and staff reports are found, under "Architectural Drawings".
- b. In response to Commissioner Veyna's inquiry about the jacaranda tree at La Playa Azul Café, the tree may cause potential foundation damage to the historic building. The Staff at the Santa Barbara Trust for Historic Preservation is working with the State Parks to evaluate the tree. Once fully evaluated, any proposed alterations require the Commission's review.
- c. In response to Commissioner Veyna's inquiry about the color of the Santa Barbara FisHouse, staff's research indicates that the building was always painted red but was recently repainted and landscape altered. Any unapproved changes will come before the Commission for review.

## 2. Ms. Hernandez announced the following

- a. City Council designated as City Landmarks the two buildings the Historic Landmarks Commission recommended, 1126 Santa Barbara Street and 30 West Arrellaga Street, on Tuesday, October 8, 2019.
- b. The Luth Maria Riggs Society will screen the film "LUTAH – A Passion for Architecture: A Life in Design" on January 5, 2020 at the Lobero Theatre.
- c. All surveys from 1978 through 1986 and all Historic Structures/Sites Reports are now available online in PDF format at the Historic Resources homepage of the City of Santa Barbara website.

## 3. Commissioner Hausz announced the following:

- a. He attended the Planning Commission meeting on October 10, 2019 and reported on the Average Unit-Size Density Incentive Program Amendment Direction item. He requested that staff agendize a discussion so the HLC could craft a statement with respect to the Design Review Boards' purview on the AUD Amendments.
- b. String lights are installed on the 500 block of State Street. Ms. Plummer stated that the lights were installed temporarily for the September 28, "Pop-Up" Common Table Event. Several business owners have expressed interest in whether the lighting can remain in place. There will be a future project scheduled to discuss long-term string lighting that will require Historic Landmarks Commission approval.

## 4. Commissioner Drury recognized Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian, for her presentation at City Council on Tuesday, October 8, 2019.

## E. Subcommittee Reports:

1. Commissioner Mahan reported on the Awards Committee.
2. Commissioner Ooley reported on the Olive Mill/Coast Village Road roundabout.

**(1:55PM) MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM****1. MULTIPLE HISTORIC RESOURCES PER ATTACHED EXHIBIT A**

Reference Number: PLN2019-00234

Staff: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian

(Review of Staff Reports and Public Hearing to consider Structure of Merit designation of historic resources per attached Exhibit A.)

Actual time: 2:00 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian, City of Santa Barbara

**RECUSAL:** To avoid any actual or perceived conflict of interest, Commissioner Drury recused himself from hearing 603 East Valerio Street, as he is within 500 feet of the property.

Public comment opened at 2:14 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

**Motion:** **Adopt a Resolution to designate as a Structure of Merit 603 East Valerio Street, with revisions to the staff report clarifying the historic integrity and architectural style of the structure.**

**Action:** Hausz/Mahan, 6/1/0. (Drury and Edmunds absent.) Motion carried.

Individual Comment: Commissioner Ooley opposed because he does not believe the building rises to the level of a Structure of Merit and is pedestrian.

The chair reopened public comment at 2:19 p.m.

The following individuals spoke:

1. Mary Louise Days
2. Julie Wood
3. Jill Kent

Written correspondence from Julie Wood was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 2:30 p.m.

The chair reopened public comment at 3:07 p.m.

The following individuals spoke:

1. Mary Louise Days

Public comment closed at 3:07 p.m.

**Straw vote:** How many Commissioners can support removing 1520 De La Vina Street from the Potential Historic Resources List as it does not qualify as a historic resource? 7/1 Passed

**Straw vote:** How many Commissioners can support removing 1225 North Salsipuedes Street from Potential Historic Resources List as it does not qualify as a historic resource? 0/8 Failed

- Straw vote: How many Commissioners can support 1225 North Salsipuedes Street remaining on the Potential Historic Resources List until more information is available to further evaluate its historic significance? 8/0 Passed
- Straw vote: How many Commissioners can support designating 1225 North Salsipuedes Street as a Structure of Merit? 4/4 Failed
- Straw vote: How many Commissioners can support designating 2323 Santa Barbara Street as a Structure of Merit? 7/1 Passed
- Straw vote: How many Commissioners can support removing 2323 Santa Barbara Street from Potential Historic Resources List as it does not qualify as a historic resource? 0/8 Failed
- Straw vote: How many Commissioners can support 2323 Santa Barbara Street remaining on the Potential Historic Resources List until more information is available to further evaluate its historic significance? 1/7 Failed
- Straw vote: How many Commissioners can support designating 112 East Sola Street a Structure of Merit? 2/6 Failed
- Straw vote: How many Commissioners can support removing 112 East Sola Street from the Potential Historic Resources List as it does not qualify as a historic resource? 3/5 Failed
- Straw vote: How many Commissioners can support 112 East Sola Street remaining on the Potential Historic Resources List until more information is available to further evaluate its historic significance? 5/3 Passed
- Straw vote: How many Commissioners can support designating 411 East Sola Street as a Structure of Merit? 0/8 Failed
- Straw vote: How many Commissioners can support removing 411 East Sola Street from the Potential Historic Resources List as it does not qualify as a historic resource? 7/1 Passed
- Straw vote: How many Commissioners can support 411 East Sola Street remaining on the Potential Historic Resources List until more information is available to further evaluate its historic significance? 1/7 Failed
- Straw vote: How many Commissioners can support designating 419 East Sola Street as a Structure of Merit? 6/2 Passed
- Straw vote: How many Commissioners can support removing 419 East Sola Street from the Potential Historic Resources List as it does not qualify as a historic resource? 1/7 Failed
- Straw vote: How many Commissioners can support 419 East Sola Street remaining on the Potential Historic Resources List until more information is available to further evaluate its historic significance? 1/7 Failed
- Straw vote: How many Commissioners can support designating 430 East Sola Street as a Structure of Merit? 0/8 Failed

Straw vote: How many Commissioners can support removing 430 East Sola Street from the Potential Historic Resources List as it does not qualify as a historic resource? 7/1 Passed

Straw vote: How many Commissioners can support 430 East Sola Street remaining on the Potential Historic Resources List until more information is available to further evaluate its historic significance? 1/7 Failed

Straw vote: How many Commissioners can support designating 510 East Valerio Street as a Structure of Merit? 1/7 Failed

Straw vote: How many Commissioners can support removing 510 East Valerio Street from the Potential Historic Resources List as it does not qualify as a historic resource? 6/2 Passed

Straw vote: How many Commissioners can support 510 East Valerio Street remaining on the Potential Historic Resources List until more information is available to further evaluate its historic significance? 2/6 Failed

**Motion: Adopt Resolutions to designate, as Structures of Merit, the multiple historic resources per attached Exhibit A, excluding the following properties: 1225 North Salsipuedes Street, 2324 Santa Barbara Street, 2325 Santa Barbara Street, and 112 East Sola Street, which will remain on the Potential Historic Resources List ; 1520 De La Vina Street, 411 East Sola Street, 430 East Sola Street, and 510 East Valerio Street, which will be removed from the Potential Historic Resources List as they do not qualify as historic resources; and 603 East Valerio Street, which was voted on separately.**

Action: Hausz/Ooley, 8/0/0. (Edmunds absent.) Motion carried.

**\* THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:32 TO 3:41 P.M. \***

**\* The item was re-opened at 3:41 p.m. \***

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

### **(2:55PM) MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM: RESOLUTION OF INTENTION**

#### **2. 740 STATE ST**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-160-015

Reference Number: PLN2019-00234

Owner: Mahoob, Mohammad/GITY

(The Commission is requested to adopt a Resolution of Intention to hold a Public Hearing on October 30, 2019 to consider Structure of Merit designation of the Spanish Colonial Revival style commercial building designed by Lionel H. Pries in 1925 located at 740 State Street.)

Actual time: 3:41 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 3:42 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

**Motion:** To adopt Resolution of Intention 2019-13 to hold a Public Hearing on October 30, 2019 to consider Structure of Merit designation of the Bothin Building, a Spanish Colonial Revival style building designed by Lionel H. Pries in 1925 located at 740 State Street.

**Action:** Ooley/Hausz, 8/0/0. (Edmunds absent.) Motion carried.

### **(3:00PM) PRE-APPLICATION REVIEW**

#### **3. 225 STATE ST**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-042-010

Zone: HRC-2/SD-3

Application Number: PLN2019-00479

Owner: Fish Co Building Group LLC

Applicant: Jeff Hornbuckle, The Cearnal Collective

(The Commercial Vernacular style building, constructed in 1925 by architect E. F. Edwards is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources as it is eligible for designation as a Structure of Merit. This is a One-Time Pre-Application Consultation: Proposal to convert 760 square feet of existing commercial building area under the existing arch openings to 760 square feet of covered outdoor patio area.)

**One-Time Pre-Application Consultation. No final appealable decision will be made at this hearing.**

Actual time: 3:43 p.m.

Present: Jeff Hornbuckle, Applicant, The Cearnal Collective

#### **Staff comments:**

1. Ms. Hernandez stated that she provided a memo outlining the history of the structure.
2. Ms. Plummer stated that after this one-time pre-application consultation, the applicant will need to submit a formal application for design review with the Historic Landmarks Commission.

Public comment opened at 3:49 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

#### **Motion: Continue indefinitely with comments:**

1. The Commission is generally supportive of opening up the patio as proposed.
2. The new exterior wall fenestration should resemble the original 1925 design.
3. Study the arch on the northwest side of the patio to match the window to other existing segmented arch windows.
4. Study a skylight and show how it will be viewed from the parking lot.
5. Verify the property lines.

**Action:** Ooley/Drury, 8/0/0. (Edmunds absent.) Motion carried.

**(3:40PM) NEW ITEM: CONCEPT REVIEW****4. 1431 OLIVE ST**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-022-007  
Zone: R-M  
Application Number: PLN2019-00428  
Owner: Matt Davis  
Applicant: Ferguson Ettinger Architects, Inc.

(The Craftsman style residence constructed circa 1920 and located in the Lower Rivera Special Design District is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources as contributing to the potential Bungalow Haven Historic District. Proposal to demolish the existing detached carport and shed located at the rear of the property, and construct a new detached two-story building comprised of a 799 square Accessory Dwelling Unit (ADU) and 400 square foot two-car garage. Project includes demolishing 105 square feet at the rear of the main residence to allow for a bridge connection from the ADU to the main residence, and an approximately 144 square foot deck at the upper level of the new building that will service the ADU. Hardscape alterations include improving the existing concrete driveway and a new textured concrete turnaround at the new building. The proposed total of 2,525 square feet on a 6,250 square foot lot is 92% of the maximum guideline floor-to-lot area ratio.)

**Concept Review. No final appealable decision will be made at this hearing.**

Actual time: 4:05 p.m.

Present: Brett Ettinger, Applicant, Ferguson Ettinger Architects, Inc.

**Staff comments:**

1. Ms. Hernandez stated that she provided a memo outlining the relevant Lower Riviera Guidelines and noted that the aluminum clad, single-pane door is the only element she found that was incompatible with a craftsmen style building.
2. Ms. Plummer stated that the project has a new detached building and is comprised of a garage and an Accessory Dwelling Unit. The ADU is under local ordinance and subject to discretionary review as the project did not qualify for ministerial review per the architectural review questionnaire.

Public comment opened at 4:26 p.m.

Written correspondence from Richard Weger and Kathleen Dagg was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 4:27 p.m.

**Motion: Continue indefinitely with comments:**

1. The Commission is generally favorable of the project and finds the mass, bulk, and scale to be sensitive to the historic resource and the neighborhood.
2. Study the use of board and batten siding on the first floor.
3. Study the detailing of the fenestration, especially the door and window divisions, with the suggestion that they be double hung or more traditionally Craftsman in style.
4. Study widening the Juliette balcony.
5. Additional study of the current door window design on the southwest elevation of the original house is needed.
6. Once the architect addresses the comments above, the project will be ready to submit for Project Design Approval.

Action: Drury/Hausz, 8/0/0. (Edmunds absent.) Motion carried.

**(4:25PM) PROJECT DESIGN APPROVAL AND FINAL APPROVAL****5. 1790 SYCAMORE CANYON RD**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 013-163-018

Zone: RS-1A

Application Number: PLN2019-00128

Owner: Kara Block

Applicant: Karl Kras, Kras Design Studio

(This site contains a designated City Landmark: Jack's Trough/Courtney Fountain, constructed in 1926 by Lulah Riggs. The lot is otherwise vacant as the original non-historic residence was demolished. Proposal for a new 1,930 square foot two-story residence and detached 665 square foot garage to be constructed. The project includes new entry gates and restoration of the historic fountain. The proposed total of 2,595 square feet on a 34,309 square foot lot is 54% of the maximum guideline floor-to-lot area ratio.)

**Project Design Approval and Final Approval are requested. This project requires an environmental finding for a CEQA Guidelines Section 15183 Exemption (Projects Consistent with the General Plan). Landmark and Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance findings are required. Project was last reviewed on May 1, 2019.**

Actual time: 4:59 p.m.

Present: Karl Kras, Applicant, Kras Design Studio; and Kara Block, Owner

Staff comments: Ms. Plummer stated that the project is under the same Accessory Dwelling Unit ordinance as the previous project.

Public comment opened at 5:11 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.



**Motion: Project Design Approval and Final Approval with the following findings and comments:**

1. The exterior light fixtures should have shielded or seeded glass.
2. The invasive plant species *pennisetum setaceum* is inappropriate and shall not be used.
3. As required for Landmarks in section 22.22.080 of the Municipal Code: The exterior alterations are being made primarily for the purpose of restoring the Landmark to its original appearance or to substantially aid in the preservation or enhancement of the Landmark. The project will not cause a substantial adverse change in the significance of the historic resource.
4. The Commission has reviewed the proposed project and found that the project is consistent with the required Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance findings (per SBMC 22.69.050) as follows:
  - a. Consistency and Appearance. The proposed development is consistent with the scenic character of the City and will enhance the appearance of the neighborhood.
  - b. Compatibility. The proposed development is compatible with the neighborhood, and its size, bulk, and scale is appropriate to the site and neighborhood.
  - c. Quality Architecture and Materials. The proposed buildings and structures are designed with quality architectural details.
  - d. Trees. The proposed project does not include the removal of or significantly impact any designated Specimen Tree, Historic Tree, or Landmark Tree.
  - e. Health, Safety, and Welfare. The public health, safety, and welfare are appropriately protected and preserved.
  - f. Good Neighbor Guidelines. The project generally complies with the Good Neighbor Guidelines regarding privacy, landscaping, noise, and lighting.
  - g. Public Views. The development, including proposed structures and grading, preserves significant public scenic views of and from the hillside.
5. The Commission makes the finding that the project qualifies for an exemption from further environmental review under CEQA Guidelines Section 15183, based on the City staff analysis and CEQA Certificate of Determination on file for this project.

Action: Lenvik/Nemec, 3/1/1. (Hausz abstained. Ooley, Drury, Veyna, and Edmunds absent.) Motion carried.

Individual Comment: Commissioner Mahan opposed because he believes the site and landscape around the fountain does not enhance the Landmark, but thanks the applicant for restoring it.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

**\* THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 5:50 TO 5:54 P.M. \***

**(5:10PM) IN-PROGRESS REVIEW HEARING****6. 433 E CABRILLO BLVD**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-680-009  
Zone: HRC-2/SP-1/SD-3  
Application Number: PLN2016-00284  
Owner: American Tradition LLC  
Applicant: Suzanne Elledge  
Architect: Robert Glazier

(This is a revised project description. Proposal for an 86 room hotel at a project site comprised of two parcels: a 3-acre "Hotel Site" at 433 E. Cabrillo Boulevard (APN 017-680-009), and an adjacent 2.42-acre "Parking Lot Site" at 103 S. Calle Cesar Chavez (APN 017-113-020). The Hotel Site is within El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District (EPV) and will be reviewed by the Historic Landmarks Commission; the Parking Lot Site is outside of EPV and will be reviewed by the Architectural Board of Review. The Hotel Site is currently permitted for a 150-room hotel with conference and group facilities. Proposed is a revised design for a smaller development at the Hotel Site consisting of two and three story structures. The proposed square footage on this lot is approximately 88,000 square feet. Program elements include a casual and fine dining restaurant, wine cellar and lounge, rooftop swimming pool and pool bar, spa, banquet room, water features, and gardens. Automobile and pedestrian access to the hotel will be from Calle Cesar Chavez via a motor court and accessible sidewalk at a reception pavilion. Back-of-house functions, service areas, and at-grade parking are proposed for the Parking Lot site.)

**In-Progress Review of revised architectural elevations. No final appealable decision will be made at this hearing. The exterior changes result from proposed floor plan changes to provide 86 rather than 60 hotel rooms, as well as back of house floor area. The building footprint and height remain as previously approved. The proposed changes must be found by the Community Development Director to be in substantial conformance with the approved Development Plan and Coastal Development Permit. The Planning Commission will review the proposed changes at an upcoming hearing and provide comments to the Community Development Director for a decision on the substantial conformance determination request. The project was granted Project Design Approval on November 14, 2018 and last reviewed on September 18, 2019.**

Actual time: 5:54 p.m.

Present: Tony Boughman, Assistant Planner, City of Santa Barbara; Suzanne Elledge, Applicant, Suzanne Elledge Planning and Permitting Services; and Robert Glazier, Architect

Public comment opened at 6:15 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

**Motion: Continue indefinitely to the Planning Commission with the comment that the Commission finds the changes to be in substantial conformance with the Project Design Approval and is pleased with the project.**

Action: Mahan/Nemec, 4/0/1. (Hausz abstained. Ooley, Drury, Veyna, and Edmunds absent.) Motion carried.

**\* MEETING ADJOURNED AT 6:26 P.M. \***

**EXHIBIT A**

	<b>St Number</b>	<b>Prefix</b>	<b>St Name Vicinity</b>	<b>Year Built</b>	<b>APN</b>
1	136	E.	De La Guerra St.	1964-5	031-081-018
2	223	E.	De la Guerra St.	1926	031-012-027
3	1520		De la Vina St.	1907	027-222-022
4	1603		De la Vina St.	1887-88	027-171-013
5	1255		Ferrelo Rd.	1967	029-271-010
6	1225	N	Salsipuedes St.	c. 1915	291-141-023
7	1301		Santa Barbara St.	1931	029-071-008
8	1332		Santa Barbara St.	1880 & 1922	029-072-028
9	1515		Santa Barbara St.	1909	027-241-008
10	1731		Santa Barbara St.	1907	027-111-016
11	1822		Santa Barbara St.	1885	027-042-020
12	1926		Santa Barbara St.	1916	025-382-022
13	2003		Santa Barbara St.	1920	025-322-008
14	2021		Santa Barbara St.	1929	025-322-003
15	2323		Santa Barbara St.	1921	025-131-006
16	2324		Santa Barbara St.	1921	025-132-015
17	2325		Santa Barbara St.	1919	025-131-005
18	2327		Santa Barbara St.	1922	025-131-015
19	14	E.	Sola St.	1903	039-132-004
20	112	E.	Sola St.	1921	029-071-019
21	401	E.	Sola St.	c. 1915	029-022-024
22	411	E.	Sola St.	c. 1905	029-022-022
23	419	E.	Sola St.	c. 1931	029-022-020
24	424	E.	Sola St.	c. 1920	029-085-006
25	430	E.	Sola St.	c. 1920	029-085-007
26	35		State St.	1925	033-102-004
27	2101		State St.	1935	025-241-012
28	2135		State St.	1925	025-241-007
29	2310		State St.	1922	025-123-017
30	2331		State St.	1930	025-122-004
31	2419		State St.	1924	025-071-009
32	2426		State St.	1915	025-072-018
33	920		Summit Rd.	1916, 1921, several remodels	009-091-020; 015-300-001
34	219		Toyon Dr.	1930	053-233-007
35	15	E.	Valerio St.	1883	027-102-015
36	28	E.	Valerio St.	1906	027-182-022
37	335	E.	Valerio St.	1884	027-121-010
38	510	E.	Valerio St.	c. 1921	027-132-002
39	603	E.	Valerio St.	1917	027-142-010